NOTE: Agenda and Reports may be amended as necessary or as required. Applicants, Please Review Your Proposal for accuracy.

Board Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-</th>
<th>Beckman</th>
<th>Bloch</th>
<th>Brown</th>
<th>Essman</th>
<th>Fairbanks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moeller</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jacobs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-</th>
<th>Spoonster</th>
<th>Traub</th>
<th>Weltzer</th>
<th>Whalen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albinus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ripperger</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>O’Neill</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I. Roll Call:

II. Swearing in of Those Providing Testimony to the Board:
   Notary Public

III. Approval of Meeting Minutes – Written Summary and Audio Recording for these dates:
   A. November 5, 2019
   B. November 19, 2019
   C. December 3, 2019

IV. Properties Seeking COA - New Business
   1. No COA requests at this time.

V. Miscellaneous/Discussion/On the Radar
   a. Demolition Guidelines Review
   b. Window Guidelines Review
   c. Paint Guidelines Review
   d. 233 S B Inquiry (Shed/Garage)

VI. Adjourn

VII. Guests:
EXHIBIT “A”

Proposed Edits for Demolition Approval in a Historic District or for Historic Inventory Structures.

NOTE: The following proposed language will fully replace the current Demolition Guidelines section of the Architectural Design Review Board, Policies & Guidelines

Demolition Requests – Approval of Demolition of a Property in a Historic District or Historic Inventory Structure

Requests for Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition will be granted or denied based on the Board’s evaluation of the following criteria:

In the absence of a State of Ohio or city mandate, or city declared nuisance, when an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is filed, there will be no approval of demolition of any structure, located in a historic district or included as part of a historic inventory regulated by the Architectural Design Review Board, unless the applicant can prove, with credible evidence, a specific need, and justification for demolition of the structure exists. Historic structures and the Historic Districts have significant value placed on them by the City and demolition of historical structures represents a loss of unique architecture, history, and character of the historic neighborhoods and the City.

The applicant shall be required to submit sufficient documentation from qualified professionals that supports that at least two (2) of the following conditions from the Architectural Design Review Board Policies & ADRB Guidelines: Approval of Demolition of a Property in a Historic District or Historic Inventory Structure apply:

(Continued on Next Page)

1 Financial quotes or similar, in writing: of repairing, rehabilitating, or restoring the existing structure and architecture, with same materials, same components, and same craftsmanship
2 This can include but is not limited to: structural assessments of the viability of the building; comparative financial quotes, in writing: of restoring the structure compared to demolition; written or demonstrable evidence of actively marketing the property over a period of at least several months. Please refer to the criteria for consideration of a demolition proposal.
Criteria for **Consideration of Approval of Demolition**
(At least two (2) out of the following five (5) conditions, A through E, are required):

A. That the property proposed for demolition is not inherently consistent with other properties in its area of the Architectural Conservation/Historic District. For example, it may have been built at a time outside of the period of significance of the historic district.

B. That the property proposed for demolition contains no features of architectural and/or historical significance. The structure proposed for demolition has no architectural significance or historical significance either, due to:

1. Significant loss of original architectural features.
2. Significant loss of decorative or other architectural features that contribute to a historic structure and historic district.
3. Compounding alterations and changes to the structure that render original architecture and historic significance lost or indeterminable.
4. The structure contains no historic architectural features (i.e. modern buildings or modern additions to a historic structure).
5. Architectural and historical significance can be attributed to the finding of or the lack of several factors. Refer to the Supplemental criteria found within the following sections of the Demolition Guidelines: “Architectural Significance”, “Historical Significance” and/or “Historic Designation”

(Continued on Next Page)
C. That there is no reasonable economic use for the property as it exists or as it might be rehabilitated, that there is no feasible means or prudent alternative to demolition.

1. The applicant has submitted evidence of attempts at alternatives to demolition of the structure.

2. The applicant has submitted evidence of having no reasonable economic use that allows for preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, or reconstruction of the structure.

3. The applicant has submitted evidence illustrating significant damage or structural issues pertaining to the structure that would present a specific infeasibility towards the use or occupation of the structure, as it currently exists, or an economic infeasibility towards the preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, or reconstruction of the structure.

4. The property owner and/or applicant has actively marketed the property and structure for the purposes of maintenance, preservation, restoration, or reconstruction, and not demolition. The property owner and/or applicant has provided detailed documentation demonstrating marketing efforts such as Requests for Proposals (RFPs) or an MLS listing.

**Detailed Information Required:**

The property owner and/or applicant shall provide detailed information supporting this claim, such as:

a. Length of time the property was marketed or for sale and response to the marketing efforts;

b. Lack of interest in maintenance, preservation, restoration, or reconstruction of the property; and/or

c. Cost of rehabilitation of structure compared to estimated property value post-rehabilitation.

(Continued on Next Page)
D. Existing structures listed in Section 1126.110 (Central Area Building Inventory) shall be maintained. No demolition proposal will be accepted:

1. Without evidence showing significant financial infeasibility of preserving, rehabilitating, restoring or reconstructing the structure. An example might be providing a pro forma that documents how the costs of rehabilitation could not be recuperated reasonably through the reuse of the building.

2. Without a detailed plan of demolition and potential reuse of the property.

3. Without a detailed plan of preserving any remaining exterior architectural features and/or historical features of the structure and site.

In addition to the above:

4. For a demolition application of a Central Area Inventory Building, it is mandatory that the property owner and/or applicant has a pre-application meeting with the board at a regular Architectural Design Review Board (ADRB) meeting, and/or holds a public meeting with stakeholders, before the item is included on an ADRB Agenda for review and final action by the board.

The list of properties included in the Central Area Building Inventory:

| 105 Court Street | 23 S. Second Street | 222 High Street |
| 320 High Street  | 311-315 Ludlow Street | 100 Monument Street |
| 320 S. Front Street | 120 S. Second Street | 215 S. Third Street |
| 228-234 Court Street | 1 High Street | 228-236 High Street |
| 332 High Street  | 337 Ludlow Street | 111 S. Front Street |
| 105 N. Second Street | 319 S. Second Street | 220 S. Third Street |
| 309-311 Court Street | 101 High Street | 254 High Street |
| 10 Journal Square | 10 Monument Street | 212 S. Front Street |
| 128 N. Second Street | 136 N. Third Street | 225 S. Third Street |
| 19 S. Front Street | 219 High Street | 300 High Street |
| 225 Ludlow Street | 20 Monument Street | 301 S. Third Street |
| 2 S. Second Street | 100 S. Third Street |

(Continued on Next Page)
E. The demolition of the property would contribute to a significant economic development purpose or proposal that furthers the City of Hamilton’s comprehensive plan, Plan Hamilton. That the demolition would have a strategic economic impact to the historic district or neighborhood as a whole beyond the individual property.

This can include some or all of the following, but is not limited to:

1. The property would be demolished for a major roadway or traffic improvement, specifically for traffic safety or traffic management.

2. The property is located around or near a collection of other developable properties and can be utilized for a strategic city purpose and/or as part of a potential large-scale redevelopment. A development proposal should be in place as part of the demolition application.

3. Property will be part of a new business or business redevelopment that creates new a significant number of jobs and is reasonably unable to adapt the historic structure or property in the development plan.

**Mandatory Items for Criteria “E”**

In addition to the above, the following items are required for consideration of this criterion:

4. The proposal will require a reuse plan for the property, which will include a site plan that is legible, preferably professionally drawn. The reuse plan can be preliminary or final, and shall be approved with the COA for demolition.

5. Demonstration of the infeasibility of reusing or incorporating the existing structure as part of the development proposal.

6. The proposed project is large-scale in nature, such as a commercial building, mixed-use development, or apartment complex, that complements the design of the historic district and is supported by the City of Hamilton Economic Development Department.

**Miscellaneous:**

Any property ordered for demolition by the City’s Court system or declared a public safety nuisance by a City Authority (Health Commissioner or Building Department Administrator) is exempt from ADRB review. [Added: September 2009 – ADRB Meeting]
Supplemental Considerations for Evaluation of Properties Proposed for Demolition

Criteria “B” states, that “the property proposed for demolition contains no features of architectural and/or historical significance.” Below is additional information that speaks to what is meant by Architectural and Historical significance.

Architectural Significance

The architectural significance of a structure or property, as defined by the presence of historic architectural components and features. A structure can have significance in one (1) or more of the following ways:

1. Existence of historic architectural features original to the structure, that are not in a state of extreme disrepair (siding, windows, doors, box gutters, roof, etc.).

2. The structure possesses some architectural details of particular interest or particular historic uniqueness.

3. The structure is a very early example of a construction type, or an example of a transition of one architectural style to another.

4. The structure contains a unique architectural design or is a work of special interest.

5. The structure is recognized as the design or product of an architect or citizen integral to the history and/or culture of Hamilton and the historic districts.

6. The structure is a very early example of a construction type, or an example of a transition of one architectural style to another.

7. The structure is a contributing building to the historic district. Such examples include structures included in the Local Historic Inventory and/or the State of Ohio Historic Inventory, and/or property located along a major street of a historic district
   a. Rossville: Ross Avenue, Main Street, South D Street
   b. Dayton-Campbell (Dayton Lane): Dayton Street, Campbell Street
   c. German Village: North Third Street, North Second Street
   d. Downtown: Multiple buildings are very unique architecturally and lend to the character of downtown and the city. Buildings can be evaluated for architectural significance and considered on a case-by-case basis.

(Continued on Next Page)
Historic Significance

The historical significance of a structure or property, as defined by the existing historic designations on the structure or property. Depending on the level of historic designation, the structure has historic significance in one (1) or more of the following ways:

1. Structure or property is a noteworthy example of a particular architectural style, craftsmanship, or method of construction.

2. The structure or property is a rare or sole survivor of a style of construction or development.

3. The structure or establishes a broader pattern of historic development in the historic district, neighborhood, or the city.

4. The structure or property is associated with the life or activities of persons significant to the historic district, neighborhood, and/or the city, related to the context of local history and impact.

5. The structure and/or property is associated with historic events or historic trends related to the historic district, neighborhood, or the city.

6. The structure or property is integral to the development patterns of the cultural history of the historic district, neighborhood, or the city. Examples include historical industrial sites, and structures related to religious or ethnic groups.

7. The structure is an original surviving structure of the Great 1913 Flood (primarily applicable to German Village, Dayton Lane).

(Continued on Next Page)
Supplemental Information and Assistance for Demolition proposals:

Because demolishing a historic structure is the most significant alteration to a historic building that can occur, the ADRB suggests that applicant complete additional steps before submitting a demolition request. The applicant may want to consider completing one or more of the following activities:

1. Meet with Planning Department Staff about a potential demolition application, before submitting for a Certificate of Appropriateness Application (COA Application).

2. Explore alternatives to demolition regarding the structure before proposing demolition.
   a. This can include:
      i. Rehabilitation of the structure (either all at once, or incrementally over a period of time). The ADRB and Staff encourage sound repair and rehabilitation of a structure. Both the ADRB and Staff can be consulted for steps moving forward.
      ii. Repair of key areas of the structure to prevent damage and deterioration (repair of roof, gutters – to prevent water leaks)
      iii. Marketing of the property to other interested parties.

3. Research the available history and records of a potential property proposed for demolition.

4. Meet with the respective historic district organization that would be directly impacted by the demolition.

5. Schedule a pre-application meeting with the board at a regular Architectural Design Review Board (ADRB) meeting, to evaluate the structure and the situation.
   a. Applicants can contact Planning Department Staff to help facilitate a pre-application meeting with the ADRB.
   b. The ADRB can accommodate a pre-application meeting if planned at least seven (7) days before a scheduled meeting.

(Continued on Next Page)
6. When proposing demolition, the property owner / applicant should consider a salvage plan.
   a. Will salvageable architectural features and site features be saved for use or donation towards other historic projects? This can include: remaining windows, doors, railing, fencing, decorative features, and other original historic features.
   b. Will interior components, such as doors, mantles, railing, and other structural items contributing to historic character, be saved?

7. When proposing demolition, there should be a reuse plan of the vacant property. Reuse plan can be one of, but is not limited to the following:
   a. Redevelopment proposals for the site. (Projects, Site Plans, Concepts)
   b. Marketing and advertisement of the site for reuse and redevelopment.

8. If the demolition is part of a commercial development or other non-residential development:
   a. Consider integrating the historic structure as part of the development.
   b. Preserving an existing structure can help maintain the historic integrity of the site or neighborhood, while offering a unique asset and potential draw for the site/development.

(Continued on Next Page)
Refusal or Postponement of Demolition Application

If the Architectural Design Review Board (ADRB) and/or Planning Staff finds that the application does not meet the above criteria, the application for Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition shall be refused.

Or, the ADRB and the applicant can agree to a postponement of the application to a later ADRB meeting. Such postponement or delay of the review of a demolition application shall not exceed 120 calendar days.

The ADRB and Planning Staff shall work with the applicant to evaluate the application and property in question, and reconcile a revised plan.

Appeal of ADRB Decision

If the Architectural Design Review Board (ADRB) and the applicant are unable to reconcile an alternative plan to demolition, and if the Architectural Design Review Board (ADRB) refuses the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition, the applicant may appeal the decision of the Architectural Design Review Board to the City’s Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA).
Table of Contents

Windows 2

Preface (Why Historic Windows): ................................................................. 2

General Window Regulations & Guidelines .................................................. 3

A. Critical Parts of Windows that Shall Not Be Altered ................................ 3
B. General Window Requirements (Unless otherwise approved) ................. 3
C. Do not buy windows before getting a COA (Certificate of Appropriateness) approval... 3

Window Work approvable by Planning Staff .................................................. 4

A. Repair of Windows .................................................................................. 4
B. Replacement Windows as Like-for-Like: .................................................. 4
   1. Replace with Wood Windows or Same Material .................................... 4

Window Work that Requires Approval by the ADRB ..................................... 7

A. Replacement Windows – (Windows less than 50% damaged or missing.) ....... 7
B. Considerations for Window Replacements: ............................................. 8
C. List of Conditional Replacement Windows ............................................. 9
   1. Vinyl Windows .................................................................................... 10
   2. Glass Block Windows ......................................................................... 10
   3. Unique window proposals .................................................................. 10
   4. Commercial Windows and Industrial Windows ................................. 10
   5. New Window Opening ....................................................................... 11
   6. Reduction of Window or Filling In Window ........................................ 11
      A. Interior Storm Windows not visible from the exterior ...................... 12
      B. Exterior Storm Windows .................................................................. 12

Prohibited Window Types and Window Work .............................................. 12

A. Wrapping Existing Wood Windows in Metal or Vinyl ............................... 12
B. Replacing Existing Windows with False Windows  Replacement of existing windows with false windows, spandrel glass, or other similar treatments is prohibited. .................................................. 12

Further Information and help with Historic Windows: ................................ 13
Windows

Preface (Why Historic Windows):

Historic windows are found on many of the buildings in Hamilton’s Historic Districts. These windows typically date from the 19th century to the early 20th century. Windows may come in all different sizes and configurations and may be unique to a particular architectural style. Windows are an important part of a building’s overall design scheme, help date the building’s construction, and contribute to the visual cohesion of both the building and the historic district streetscape – commensurate with the architectural significance of the structure. Windows are a distinctive part of any building and their shape and configuration should not be altered when possible.

The improper or insensitive treatment of windows and their openings can drastically change a building, in terms of appearance, historic significance, and contribution to a historic district or neighborhood.

Retention of historic windows should be the goal. Historic windows were built so that any part of the window could be repaired or replaced. Therefore, if just a part of the window is broken or rotted, that part of the window can be replaced. The most common argument against the retention and preservation of historic windows is that by replacing them with low-e insulated glass vinyl windows, a building owner will save a significant amount of money on energy bills. However, multiple studies note that a properly installed, affixed, glazed, and fitted historic wood window that is weather sealed actually has similar, and in some cases – better, R value (insulation value) than a low-e vinyl window.

With proper maintenance and attention, a historic window can significantly longer than a vinyl window.

4 “Let the Numbers Convince You: Do the Math.” Old House Journal 35 no. 5 (September/October 2007).
General Window Regulations & Guidelines

A. Critical Parts of Windows that Shall Not Be Altered

The following items will be considered a critical part of the exterior architectural/design elements that shall not be altered on a structure, except on a case-by-case basis:

1. The specific location of each individual window.
2. The specific style of each individual window.
3. The number of panes (lights/grids/sashes) of each individual window. (example: 2x2 grid/pane, 4x4 grid/pane, 9x9 grid/pane)
4. The specific dimensions of each individual window.
5. The specific treatment of the framing for each individual window.
6. The relationship of the above elements and/or related elements for each window in the overall window treatment/design of a structure.

B. General Window Requirements (Unless otherwise approved)

1. All glass for the windows is to be clear unless otherwise approved by the ADRB.
2. All composite, fiberglass, or aluminum surfaces are to be smooth, without faux-wood texture (grooved texture).
3. Windows and window products must be paintable if the building is intended to be paintable.
4. Commercial window frames should match trim unless otherwise approved by the ADRB.

C. Do not buy windows before getting a COA (Certificate of Appropriateness) approval

There is no guarantee your proposal will be approved as you desire. For instance, you may be approved for only replacing the side windows and rear windows; or the rear windows only; or your chosen replacement of windows may be denied outright. The ADRB is a preservation board, with a purpose of preserving historic structures, including the unique architectural designs and components of historic buildings.
**Window Work approvable by Planning Staff**

The following window proposals and products are permitted in the historic districts and historic inventory properties. Such proposals will be considered like-for-like approval or minor approval by Staff, and will not need review and approval from the ADRB.

A. **Repair of Windows**
   1. Repair of existing windows is encouraged by the ADRB.
   2. Repair of existing windows can be approved administratively by Planning Staff.

B. **Replacement Windows as Like-for-Like:**

The following replacement windows can be approved administratively by Planning Staff as a minor approval item, if the following conditions apply:

1. Replace with Wood Windows or Same Material

   Proposed replacement windows that are the same material as the existing window are permitted and considered Like-for-Like with the exception of vinyl windows. The window must match the existing window in location, style, size, dimensions, grids/sashes/panes, and treatment. Like for like replacement is permitted with the exception to vinyl widows.

   - For all like-for-like replacement windows: The product must be paintable if the building is intended to be painted.
   - Any proposed window that is different from the existing window requires ADRB review, approval, and issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA).
   - Below is a list of wood windows that have been identified by the ADRB as a like-for-like replacement option. This list is not comprehensive and will be updated as additional products are reviewed through the ADRB process.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MANUFACTURER</th>
<th>SERIES</th>
<th>MATERIAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Andersen</td>
<td>400 Series Woodwright [Link]</td>
<td>Fibrex (40% Wood Fiber, 60% Polymer) Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andersen</td>
<td>400 Series [Link]</td>
<td>Vinyl Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andersen</td>
<td>A Series [Link]</td>
<td>Fibrex Exterior / Fiberglass and Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiber Frame</td>
<td>2100 Series [Awning] [Casement] [Picture]</td>
<td>Fiberglass Exterior &amp; Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marvin</td>
<td>Infinity [Link]</td>
<td>Fiberglass Exterior &amp; Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marvin</td>
<td>Elevate Double Hung [Link]</td>
<td>Fiberglass Exterior &amp; Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pella</td>
<td>Impervia [Link]</td>
<td>Fiberglass Composite Exterior &amp; Interior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Replacement of Significantly Damaged or Missing Windows

In the event that the window is significantly damaged or missing, Planning staff may be able to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness administratively for window replacement.

1. Window is significantly damaged: This means that the window is damaged or rotted 50% or more, or is missing key components. (In such cases, photo evidence shall be required).
   - Half of the window is missing
   - Missing window sash and/or frame
   - Damaged/Missing window sill

2. Window is missing: the window is missing, leaving only a window opening in the façade or a bricked in place where the window once was.

C. List of Approved Replacements for Significantly Damaged or Missing Windows

The list of approved replacement windows for significantly damaged or missing windows is more varied than the like-for-like list and includes composite windows. To the extent the design of the original window is known, the window must match the historic window in location, style, size, dimensions, grids/sashes/panes, proportions, and treatment.

- The product must be paintable if the building is intended to be paintable.
- Any proposed window that is different from the historic window requires ADRB review, approval, and issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA).
- Below is a list of windows that have been identified by the ADRB as a window that can be approved administratively for a significantly damaged or missing window. This list is not comprehensive and will be updated as additional products are reviewed through the ADRB process.

(Continued on Next Page)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MANUFACTURER</th>
<th>SERIES</th>
<th>MATERIAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Andersen</td>
<td>100 Series [Link]</td>
<td>Fibrex (40% Wood Fiber, 60% Polymer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Exterior &amp; Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JeldWen</td>
<td>Siteline [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marvin</td>
<td>Ultimate-Next Generation 2.0 [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trimline</td>
<td>Eclipse EC300 [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quaker</td>
<td>H600 &quot;Historical Series&quot; [1] [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal</td>
<td>700 Series [1] [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum Exterior &amp; Interior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D. Non-Historic Window Replacement

Applications for new windows that will replace existing replacement windows that are not considered historic, including but not limited to existing vinyl replacement windows, can be approved administratively. To the extent the design of the original window is known, the window must match the historic window in location, style, size, dimensions, grids/sashes/panes, and treatment. The ADRB’s preference is for non-vinyl paintable windows. Other proposed replacement may require ADRB approval.
Window Work that Requires Approval by the ADRB
The following windows are conditional and require review and approval by the ADRB. The ADRB may also assign additional conditions to the approval of these window projects.

A. Replacement Windows – (Windows less than 50% damaged or missing.)

Replacement windows shall not be considered unless the applicant has presented sufficient evidence that the original windows to be replaced are too deteriorated to be repaired, but are not 50% or more damaged or missing.

The replacement window must match the existing window in location, style, size, dimensions, grids/sashes/panes, and treatment. The product must be paintable if the building is intended to be painted.

Facades:

1. Front Façade –

   This is the most important façade and shall have the most stringent window requirements.

   a. The first priority shall be the repair of the existing windows.

   b. The second priority shall be minor replacement of damaged parts of an existing window, matching the original in size, scale, proportion, material, and detail.

   c. The third priority shall be the relocation of surviving original windows from other facades to the front façade, where feasible and where reasonable given the size, condition, style, design, and dimensions.

   d. The replacement of historic windows on the front façade will be considered after the applicant has worked with the ADRB to preserve the windows and has exhausted feasible efforts to rehabilitate the windows. When this occurs, the windows should be replaced with a permitted replacement window type (see List of Conditional Window Replacement) or a close approximation to one of these products.

2. Side Façade & Rear Facade –

   These are secondary façades and shall be considered with greater leniency. The ADRB’s priority is the preservation of historic windows, but if the window is not visible from the street, the ADRB can consider window replacement with a permitted window type with a great deal of flexibility.
B. Considerations for Window Replacements:

When the ADRB is reviewing a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, the following information will be considered to determine the appropriateness of replacing historic windows:

1. That multiple avenues of preserving the historic windows have been pursued, including consulting a historic window preservation specialist or contractor with demonstrable background and experience in preserving historic windows.

2. Difficulty in repairing the existing wood windows or difficulty in obtaining a contractor to repair the existing wood windows.

3. Difficulty in obtaining new wood windows or wood composite windows that match the existing wood windows.

4. The structure or portion of structure is comparatively more modern or newer than other houses and principal structures in the immediate area. This can include new additions of a structure.

5. That the request for window replacement is part of a large scale renovation project in a building that is substantial disrepair and would be in danger of demolition if not for the renovation project.

ADRB has asked the applicants to provide written evidence to support these considerations, including estimates, quotes, and/or recommendations from a professional and/or letters on letterhead with signature of the professional(s) involved in the assessment.

Information about the overall project and building condition is requested. Cost information on structural stabilization work, historic gutter rehabilitation, and other relevant preservation efforts should be included.

In all situations that ADRB is considering window replacement, the windows shall match the design of the historic window and the preference is for one of the approved window models or a close approximation.
C. List of Conditional Replacement Windows

Below is a list of windows reviewed by the Architectural Design Review Board (ADRB) through Certificate of Appropriateness Applications (COA) or through additional research. These windows may be proposed as a replacement type, but still require ADRB review, approval and issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA).

An applicant is welcome to propose an alternative window, but the ADRB requests that the applicant provide information on how it is a close approximation of one of the windows listed below. The product must be paintable if the building is intended to be painted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MANUFACTURER</th>
<th>SERIES</th>
<th>MATERIAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Andersen</td>
<td>100 Series [Link]</td>
<td>Fibrex (40% Wood Fiber, 60% Polymer) Exterior &amp; Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JeldWen</td>
<td>Siteline [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marvin</td>
<td>Ultimate-Next Generation 2.0 [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trimline</td>
<td>Eclipse EC300 [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior / Wood Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quaker</td>
<td>H600 “Historical Series” (For Heavy Commercial or Industrial Only) [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal</td>
<td>700 Series (For Heavy Commercial or Industrial Only) [Link]</td>
<td>Aluminum Exterior &amp; Interior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes for Conditional Approval Type Replacement Windows:

- [1]: The window is intended only for Industrial or Heavy Commercial historic buildings and projects.
D. Other Window Replacement Types

1. Vinyl Windows

Vinyl windows are generally considered inappropriate for historic structures and the historic districts. Vinyl windows typically do not replicate the profiles, dimensions, sizes, styles, or finish of historic windows, making them inappropriate for primary elevations (front of the structure, portions of the structure visible to the street/sidewalk, corner elevations) of historic properties. Vinyl windows are not paintable, which can also detract from the appropriateness and character of a structure. This material for windows may last up to 15 years compared to the lifetime of historic windows that can last up to 60 to 100 years. Outfitting historic buildings with modern replacement windows can and often does result in a mechanical, contrived, or uniformly sterile appearance. Worse, when historic windows are replaced, authenticity is lost forever.

Vinyl replacement windows shall only be considered if the window matches the existing window in appearance, location, style, size, dimensions, grids/sashes, treatment, and design. If approved, vinyl windows shall match the trim color of the structure.


2. Glass Block Windows

Glass Block windows can be considered where the existing basement windows are damaged, deteriorated, or missing or where the existing basement windows pose a safety concern (history of break-ins, etc.)

3. Unique window proposals

For unique window proposals, such as stained glass windows, and other window proposals not addressed by the guidelines, the proposals shall be reviewed by the ADRB.

4. Commercial Windows and Industrial Windows

Windows for businesses, commercial structures, and heavy industrial structures shall be considered on a case-by-case basis. There are cases where commercial and industrial structures require a different window type than the existing window. When the proposal is not appropriate for staff administrative review, ADRB will consider all relevant factors, including:

a. Replacement windows can be any material appropriate to the structure, including metal products.
b. The replacement window shall replicate the size and transparency of the existing window (if reducing or filling a window, or creating a new opening, please refer to that section of the window guidelines).
   o If the applicant is proposing a window that does not match the existing design, sufficient justification for the change must be provided to the ADRB. This may include but is not limited to considerations such as the viability of the business operation and/or historical examples of why the proposed change is appropriate.

5. New Window Opening

New window openings are typically discouraged for historic structures. Such additions interfere with the architecture and composition of the façade of the structure. However, adding a new window opening to the structure will be considered on a case-by-case basis by the ADRB. The following rationale shall be considered by the ADRB in the issuance of a COA for such proposals:

- Structure is a commercial or industrial building and the new window opening is necessary for the viability of the business.

- Structure is part of a significant residential, commercial, rehabilitation project, or business investment for the property, neighborhood, and/or historic district.

6. Reduction of Window or Filling In Window

The following window proposals are conditional and generally considered inappropriate. Such proposals will be reviewed with the highest scrutiny and will only be approved when appropriate to the structure and historic district. The ADRB may also assign additional conditions to the approval of these window projects.

The reduction of a window opening or filling in of a window opening shall only be considered in the following cases.

- Window reduction shall only be located on the rear or side facade and is not highly visible from the street or sidewalk.

- The ‘fill’ of the previous window shall be consistent with the material and form of the façade. (i.e. on a brick façade, the filled portion shall be brick; no plywood, painted wood panel, vinyl, plastic, or metal on any façade type)

- The replacement window is for a special, utilitarian, and/or specific renovation of the structure (the most common being, new bathroom, or closet).

- The structure or portion of structure is comparatively more modern or newer than other houses and principal structures in the immediate area. This can include new additions of a structure.

- Structure is a commercial or industrial building and the proposal is necessary for the viability of the business.
Storm Windows

A. Interior Storm Windows not visible from the exterior

Interior storm windows not visible from the exterior are considered an interior item, and are not under the purview of the Architectural Design Review Board (ADRB).

Below is a list of storm windows that can be installed without a certificate of appropriateness (COA).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MANUFACTURER</th>
<th>LOCATION</th>
<th>MATERIAL / TYPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indow</td>
<td>Interior</td>
<td>Window Inserts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Window Systems LLC</td>
<td>Interior</td>
<td>Innerglass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allied Window</td>
<td>Interior</td>
<td>Custom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Seal</td>
<td>Interior</td>
<td>Preservation Series</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magnetite</td>
<td>Interior</td>
<td>Heritage Series</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. Exterior Storm Windows

1. Storm windows shall be made out of wood or anodized aluminum
2. Storm windows shall fit be flush with the original window openings
3. Storm windows shall have a narrow sash so as not to obstruct the original window
4. Storm Windows shall be painted to match trim
5. Storm windows shall have proper glass (Plexiglass or similar materials are not permitted).
6. Storm windows shall be installed to be inconspicuous on the façade.
7. New storm windows shall match any original or existing storm windows, including color, for a consistent appearance.

Prohibited Window Types and Window Work

The following window proposals are prohibited.

A. Wrapping Existing Wood Windows in Metal or Vinyl

Wrapping existing wood windows, wood casing, or brick molding in vinyl or metal is prohibited.

B. Replacing Existing Windows with False Windows

Replacement of existing windows with false windows, spandrel glass, or other similar treatments is prohibited.
Further Information and help with Historic Windows:

This Old House, Historic Preservation Specialists - Topic: Windows / Window Replacement
https://www.thisoldhouse.com/ideas/all-about-wood-windows
https://www.thisoldhouse.com/how-to/windows
https://www.thisoldhouse.com/tags/windows

“Opening Jammed Windows”
  •  https://www.thisoldhouse.com/more/opening-jammed-windows

“How to Replace Window Sash Cords”
  •  https://www.thisoldhouse.com/how-to/how-to-replace-window-sash-cords

“How to Repair Sash Windows”.
  •  https://www.thisoldhouse.com/how-to/how-to-repair-sash-windows

“How to Repair Window, Muntins”.
  •  https://www.thisoldhouse.com/how-to/how-to-repair-window-muntin

“How to Straighten a Window”
  •  https://www.thisoldhouse.com/how-to/how-to-straighten-window

The Craftsman Blog - Topic: Windows
  •  https://thecraftsmanblog.com/all-about-historic-windows/

Home Advisor:

Repair Windows
  •  https://www.homeadvisor.com/cost/doors-and-windows/repair-windows/

Replace Storm Windows
  •  https://www.homeadvisor.com/cost/doors-and-windows/install-replace-storm-windows/

Preservation Briefs:

Preservation Brief 9: The Repair of Historic Wooden Windows
  •  http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/9-wooden-windows.htm

Preservation Brief 13: The Repair and Thermal Upgrading of Historic Steel Windows
  •  http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/13-steel-windows.htm

National Trust for Historic Preservation web site
**ADRB Policies & Guidelines**

**Painting – and Color Approval**

Please note, that it is not a requirement or regulation to paint a building in its original colors. However, these guidelines, the Architectural Design Review Board, and the respective Historic District neighborhoods encourage that buildings in the district be painted in historically accurate colors or alternatively, subdued, or muted colors. At the same time, Applicant, Property Owner and User preferences can and will be considered by the ADRB, though providing reasoning for any and all paint proposals is recommended.

The color schemes for structures vary depending on the style of the building and its date of construction. The following are some instances of architecture and possible color schemes for historic structures.
Requests for Certificates of Appropriateness involving the painting of a property and/or the color selection for the same will be treated by the Board in the following manner:

**General Recommendations:**

A. Recommend identifying and preserving all character defining features of a building that traditionally have been painted by maintaining their paints, finishes, and colors.

B. Recommend testing paint a small section of the structure in the rear (or less visible area). This would allow a preview of the new color on the physical structure, and the smaller space can be remedied easier in case an Applicant wants to change or return to the previous color.

C. Recommend using high-quality paint or acrylic coatings. Ensure paint is appropriate to the surface of the structure being painted.

D. Recommend considering adjacent properties, neighboring properties and streetscapes when considering color choices. Color combinations can be unique, but they should not overpower the visual appeal of an overall streetscape.

E. Recommend removing paint from any type of surface only when there is evidence of deterioration, such as: peeling, and excessive build-up that conceals important detailing.

F. Recommend removing deteriorated paint only down to the next intact layer using the gentlest means possible, such as:
   - Hand-Sanding,
   - Mild chemical strippers, and
   - Hand-Scraping or Wire-Brushing.

G. Ensure that all lead-based paint removal occurs according to current health and safety standards. The use of protective clothing, proper clean-up, and other measures is necessary to ensure hazard-free removal.

H. You may want to consider documenting historic paint colors before painting. This can be through taking photos of a structure before painting, keeping a small amount of paint chips of the old color, photographing.
**Not Recommended:**

Do not remove paint from any surface using abrasive stripping techniques such as:

- Sandblasting,
- Caustic solutions, and
- Propane or butane torches.

Avoid radically changing the type of finish.

Avoid stripping paint where it is firmly adhered to any type of surface.

**Wood and Wood Siding, Recommendations:**

A. Remove excess layers of deteriorating paint to facilitate window and door operation and to restore original detailing.

B. Prime and paint all elements, including both sides of floor and siding boards.

C. Follow manufacturer's directions carefully when using chemical stripping products to avoid damage to wood surfaces or personal injury.

**Not Recommended:**

Do not remove paint to bare wood or apply clear finishes or stains to give a building a "natural" look.

Do not remove paint from historic woodwork unless it is peeling. Most other conditions such as mildewing, staining, or excessive chalking only require a thorough surface cleaning before repainting.

**Masonry and Stucco, Recommendations:**

A. Maintain and repaint historically painted masonry. Masonry buildings that historically have been painted—perhaps because of the use of soft brick or incompatible later brick infill—should not be stripped.

B. Remove paint from masonry only when the following applies:
   - The paint is not historic,
   - Removing the paint will not reveal visual problems, and
The process of removal will not damage the masonry.

C. Use low-pressure water as a supplement to other acceptable paint removal techniques only on masonry buildings.

**Not Recommended:**

Generally, do not paint unpainted masonry features or walls. Paint destroys the visual character of brick or stone work, such as texture and bonding pattern. Painted masonry requires significantly greater upkeep and may hide problems.

**Color Schemes**

These guidelines recommend repainting with colors that are historically appropriate to the building style and district.

Paint color choices should consider other elements of the house, structure, and property, such as roof color, shutter color, fence color, masonry wall color, and others. Note that large trees and other elements capable of casting shadows can make your paint and colors appear darker when viewed. Further, painting the structure with consideration of the streetscape, the immediate neighborhood, and the historic district as a whole, is encouraged.

The use of color, much of which results from painting various building features, is an important part of architectural style.

Choose a simple color scheme. A three-color (3 colors) combination of paint is recommended as: Body, Trim, and Accent. Most houses require no more than four (4) colors, including the roof, which is generally not painted:

1. Roof Color
2. Wall Color (Body, Façade)
   a. Color of Main Body of Structure, Main Siding
3. Major Accent Color (Trim)
   a. for trim areas such as porch, cornice, and window frames and sashes
4. Minor accent color (Accent)
   a. for the front door, small decorative details, and, window sashes.
Note: Trim and Accent items can vary from structure to structure. Depending on the prominence of architectural features (dentils, cornices, porticos, moldings, etc.), trim and accent items can be interchanged.

Note: While three-color (3 color) schemes are recommended, proposals with more colors will be considered by the board based on circumstances of the proposal.

As a suggestion, try to investigate other appropriate color schemes by consulting historic paint catalogs and historic photographs of the building (for light/dark relationships) or by analyzing paint scrapings from the building itself. Structures have been painted repeatedly over the years and decades of their lifetime, resulting in layering of paint coats. Discovering the layers of paint could be insightful for your potential paint project and proposal.

As possibilities, please check the library or consult the Butler County Historical Society.

Color Schemes Recommendations

These color schemes represent the generally accepted colors for historic buildings based on architecture. *If selected, and appropriate swatches are provided, the paint choice could be approved by Planning Staff. The painting of trim and accents from any one neutral color (white, gray, black) to an another neutral color (white, gray, black) can be approved by Planning Staff if appropriate swatches are provided.*

The Body Color is the most crucial item for painting when working with a historic building and painting in a historic district. This should be the color choice with the most attention and consideration. The colors of the structure that cannot be changed, such as the natural appearance of masonry, in some cases roof color, and surfaces that can’t be painted should also be considered when choosing paint colors.

Color Contrasts

Colors sharply contrasting each other are not recommended.

Some examples include but are not limited to:

- Bright or Bold red used with bright or bold green
- Bright or Bold orange and bright/bold blue or bright/bold purple
- Bright or Bold yellow and bright/bold blue or bright/bold purple
- Bright or Bold warm colors used in combination with each other (bright red, orange, yellow)
• Bright or Bold cool colors used in combination with each other (bright green, blue, purple)
• Bright and/or Bold primary colors used in combination (bright red, bright yellow, bright blue)
• Bright and/or Bold secondary colors used in combination (bright orange, bright green, bright purple)
• Using singular bright, bold, and/or contrasting color on a distinct architectural element, while the other elements follow a different color scheme.
  o (Bright blue door on a structure with neutral colors or earth tone colors)
  o (Bright purple windows trim/sashes/lintels on a structure of neutral colors or earth tone colors)
Example of structure with an arguably less than desirable historic exterior color scheme.

However, color schemes can be considered depending on the type of building and applicant reasoning.

There are also structures with forms and design elements from different architectural types. The basis of applicant paint color choice on any or all of the identifiable architecture types will be considered by the board.
By Type:

Federal and Greek Revival buildings, Recommend:

- Body: white or very light colors (white, lighter grays, tans, beiges)
  - Exceptions for natural brick body
- Trim: white, light colors, or dark colors
- Accent: white, light colors, or dark colors – should either compliment the body or can be a neutral contrast from the body (black, dark or dark mute colors)
Examples of Architecture and Paint/Color

(1) **Example of a Federal with Greek Revival elements.** Note the white body, lighter tan roof, and contrast of mute dark green shutters.

(2) **A case of painting a newer rehabilitated storefront on an otherwise untouched brick building.** The paint colors while mute and of the earth tones still make their architectural elements known and visible.

(3) **A Greek Revival with elements of Italianate.** The structure has a mute sand color for the body, framed by pale green for the columns and roof trim, and complimented by brown for the window and door border accents, again returning to a different shade of the body’s color.

(4) **An unpainted Colonial Revival type structure,** but note the painting of trim in mute beige, yet the color still highlights prominent architectural features and entrances, while the complimentary mute bold red further enforces the visual emphasis.
Gothic, Gothic Revival, Italianate, and other early Victorian buildings (circa 1830-1850 approximate), Recommend:

- Trim/Major Accent: darker shades that compliment the body
Examples of Italianate Style Architecture and Paint/Color

(1) For this example (Italianate), note burgundy red body, highlighted by light gold trim for the porch roof, window lentils, and columns. A deep mute green is used for accent along the roof line and to give prominence to specific architectural features like the lentil arches and the corbels.

(2) On this Gothic/Gothic Revival, while it is a brick structure, note the use of earth tones for body, trim and accent. Red brick for the body, complimented by browns and beiges as trim, and then returning with mute pale reds for accents to compliment the brick body.

(3) On this Italianate, note the white body contrasted by black shutters, yet trim and accent beyond that consist of light grays and other whites.
Queen Anne and other High Victorian buildings (circa 1880-1900 approximate), Recommend:

- Body: Rusts, Reds, Greens, Grays, and Browns
- Trim/Major Accent:
  - Whites primarily as they will further accent the body color, particularly if one employs a bolder color. Beiges.
  - Bold or Muted variant of the Body color, depending on the Body color’s appearance.

Victorian and ‘Painted Ladies’

Paint schemes or choices of broader colors can be considered on a case-by-case basis, particularly for Victorian style buildings.

The basis of painted ladies, broader colors, and using more colors stems from structures having more trim, accents, architectural features, and ornamental features, all with potential to compliment a cohesive color design. Victorian structures of larger size, presence, and prominence may also be considered for broader colors, though the color design should be considerate of the historic district, streetscape, and neighborhood.
Examples of Queen Anne Style and Victorian Architecture and Paint/Color

(1) A Victorian with architectural prominence. The color scheme is purple: boasting a lilac body, plum color expression lines, and white as a prominent accent, complimented by a gray color roof.

(2) Queen Anne with gray as the body, richer grays for trim and accent, with slightly lighter gray for the frame and sashes of the window and other accents – note the gray color roof further ties in with the color scheme. Beige is used sparingly but to good effect to highlight ornamental architectural expression bands on the structure.

(3) A Queen Anne variant, recently painted to a slightly rich gold body with similar colors as complimentary, and light gold and white for prominent trim and accent.
Colonial Revival, Saltbox and Neoclassical buildings, Recommend:

- Body: Light Colors, or Mute Colors
- Trim/Major Accent: White Tones, Grays or Black.
Examples of Architecture and Paint/Color

(1) These can come in brick, siding or stucco – though note the example uses a white body with black trim and accent, including black shutters.

(2) A structure with Saltbox features. Note the very light cream color body with light blue accent around windows and at the roof line, contrasting with the brown roof color.

(3) A Neoclassical style residence. While this example is a brick building, there are significant colors used: such as the prominent columns and front porch structure as white, while shutters and other railing is in a black color.
**Second Renaissance, Second Empire,** Recommend:

- **Body:** Pale Earth Tones (light-mute Browns, Tans, and Grays.), Whites.
- **Trim/Major Accent:** lighter shades of neutral colors to compliment body and/or masonry.

Examples of Architecture and Paint/Color

(1) *Recommend maintaining natural masonry’s appearance, or if paint is truly desired, remain within the realm of muted earth tones with complimentary neutral colors.*

(2) *A former Italianate now in Second Empire. While this is masonry body, note the beige of the window arches, and the white of the window trim as immediate but complimentary contrast.*
**Tudor Revival**, Recommend:
- Trim: Dark Browns, Dark Reds, Dark Greens,
- Stucco/Non-Masonry: Light earth tones (light browns, tans, grays and greens).

Examples of Architecture and Paint/Color

1. Note that sometimes surfaces are masonry and have no need for paint – yet still carry a theme of firm or dark earth tones
2. A variant example of Tudor Revival with predominant brown, complimented by off-white, dark brown trim, and gray roof
**Bungalow, Craftsman** Recommend:

- Body: Light and Muted earth tones
- Trim: Contrary color to Body, though still muted color
Examples of Architecture and Paint/Color

(1) A light mute sand color body with mute green trim, and mute gold shutters. The red of the brick serves as a contrary accent to the overall structure, yet not overwhelming.

(2) This example shows a mute, light brown color for the body, contrasted by dark brown accent around the windows, while leaving doors and windows white.

(3) Another example with a light color body and trim, but using contrasting yet muted color for shutters.
Other Paint References and Literature:

A. The Board may use the following publications as reference base for decision making on color applications.


The Board may also take into consideration technical information that may be available locally, through the Ohio Historic Preservation Office, and paint sampling research from the property in question.

B. The Board will attempt to provide corresponding color matches by paint company trade name to the basic reference colors approved through the publications listed in Item “A” above.

C. For technical items not covered above, the Board will rely on the following:


3. This Old House, Website/Blog [https://www.thisoldhouse.com]

4. The Craftsman Blog [https://thecraftsmanblog.com/topic/painting/]
D. As staffing permits, the Board will attempt to provide a record of colors other than those listed in the reference publication that have been approved under selected circumstances.